BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06100008 9

# The Law of Forced Migration

## Law 547HIF

## Fall 2009

## VOLUME 2

**Michael F. Battista**

**Faculty of Law, University of Toronto**

**Materials prepared by Professor Audrey Macklin and Michael F. Battista and revised with the assistance of Zack Newton and Victoria Petherbridge**

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 2 2 2009

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# The Law of Forced Migration

## Law 547HIF

## Fall 2009

## VOLUME 2


## Michael F. Battista

## Faculty of Law, University of Toronto



**Materials prepared by Professor Audrey Macklin and Michael F. Battista and revised with the assistance of Zack Newton and Victoria Petherbridge**

## *TABLE OF CONTENTS*

## VOLUME 1


***Week One*: Introduction**

*2008 Global Trends: Refugees, Asylum-seekers, Returnees, Internally Displaced and Stateless Persons,* UN High Commissioner to Refugees, June 16, 2009 ..... 1

*Asylum Levels and Trends in Industrialized Countries - 2008 - Statistical Overview of Asylum Applications Lodged in Europe and selected Non-European Countries*, UN High Commissioner to Refugees, March 24, 2009 ..... 15

***Week Two*: Normative Claims About Forced Migration**

T. Alexander Aleinikoff, "From 'Refugee Law' to the 'Law of Coerced Migration'" (1994) Am UK Int'l L & Policy v. 16 23-27 ..... 32

Hannah Arendt, Excerpts from "The Decline of the Nation State and the End of the Rights of Man" from *The Origins of Totalitarianism* ..... 235

Michelle Macafee, "Canadian churches follow Old Testament tradition in giving haven to refugees" *The Canadian Press*, August 10, 2003 ..... 41

James C. Hathaway, "Reconceiving Refugee Law as Human Rights Protection" *J. of Refugee Studies, Vol. 4 No. 2 1991* ..... 44

Peter Penz, "Ethical Reflections on the Institution of Asylum" ..... 50

Catherine Dauvergne, "Amorality and Humanitarianism in Immigration Law" (1999) 37 Osgoode Hall L.J. 597-623 ..... 64

***Week Three*: History and Institutions of Refugee Protection**

Irving Abella and Harold Troper, '"The Line Must be Drawn Somewhere': Canada and Jewish Refugees, 1933-9" *Canadian Historical Review*, LX, 2, 1979 ..... 69

James C. Hathaway, "1.2 The 1951 Convention Definition of Refugee Status," "1.3 The Impact of the 1967 Protocol on the Convention Definition" and "1.4 International Expansion of the Refugee Concept," "The Development of the Refugee Definition in International Law" *The Law of Refugee Status*. Toronto: Butterworths, c1991 (1992 printing) ..... 78

James C. Hathaway, "What's in a Label?" *European Journal of Migration and Law* 5: 1-21, 2003 ..... 85

Charles B. Keely, "The international refugee regime(s): The end of the Cold War matters" *The International Migration Review*, New York: Spring 2001 ..... 90

Randy Lippert, "Governing Refugees: The Relevance of Governmentality to Understanding the International Refugee Regime" *Alternatives* 24 (1999), 295-328 ..... 99

Anon. (Arthur Helton), "UNHCR Note on International Protection You Won't See," (1997) 9 IJRL 267-273 ..... 109

***Week Four*: The Refugee Definition**

*1. Introduction*


*Immigration and Refugee Protection Act*, DEFINITIONS: Refugee Protection, Convention Refugees and Persons in need of Protection ..... 113
*Ward v. the Attorney General* [1993] 2 S.C.R. 689 ..... 117
*Carillo v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* 2008 FCA 94 ..... 145
Chart: "Protected Person" ..... 151


*2. Assessment of Risk*


*Adjei v. Canada* [1989] 2 F.C. 680 ..... 152
*Li v. Canada* (MCI) [2005] F.C.J No. 1 ..... 155


*3. "Country of Nationality"*


*Grygorian v. Canada* [1995] F.C. J. No. 1608 ..... 163
*Katkova v. Canada* [1997] F.C.J. No. 549 ..... 167
*Williams v. Canada* [2005] F.C.J. No. 603 ..... 177
*Hanukashvili v. Canada* [1997] F.C.J. No. 356 ..... 184
*Williams v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* 2005 FCA 126..... 187


*4. Statelessness*


*Thabet v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* (C.A.) ..... 193


*5. Persecution*


*Retnem v. Canada* [1991] F.C.J. No 428 ..... 200
*Fathi-Rad v. Canada* [1994] F.C.J. No. 506 ..... 202
*Chan v. Canada* [1995] 3 S.C.R ..... 205
*Kassatkine v. Canada* [1996] F.C.J. No. 1105 ..... 209
*Butt v. Canada* [1993] F.C.J. No. 875 ..... 212


*6. Internal Flight Alternative*


*Rasaratnam v. Canada* [1992] 1 F.C.706 ..... 216
*Thirunavukkararasu v. Canada* [1994] 1 F.C. 589 ..... 219
*Ranganathan v. Canada* [2001] 2 F.C. 164 ..... 225

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/lawofforcedmigra02batt

***Week Five*: The Refugee Definition Continued**

*1. Persecution: Civil War and Non-State Actors*

*Salibian v. Canada* [1990] 3 F.C. 250 ..... 231
*Rajudeen v. Canada* [1984] F.C.J No. 601 ..... 234

*2. State Protection From Non-State Persecutors*

*Canada v. Smith* ..... 237
*Zhuravlev v. Canada* ..... 246

*3. Conscientious Objector*

*Zolfagharkhani v. Canada* [1993] 3 F.C. 540 ..... 257
*Hinzman v. Canada; Hughey v. Canada* [2007] F.C.J. No. 584 ..... 265

*4. Grounds of Persecution*

a) *Race and Nationality*

Immigration and Refugee Board Legal Services, *Interpretation of the Convention Refugee Definition in the Case Law,* "Race and Nationality as Grounds of Persecution" ..... 269
*Veeravagu v. Canada* ..... 270

b) *Religion*

*Yang v. Canada* [2001] F.C.J. No 1463 ..... 272
*Fosu v. Canada* [1994] F.C.J. No. 1813 ..... 278
*Chabira v. Canada* [1994] F.C.J. No. 127 ..... 281

c) *Political Opinion*

*Hilo v. Canada* [1991] F.C.J. No 228 ..... 284
*Shahiraj v. Canada* [2001] F.C.J. No. 734 ..... 288
*Klinko v. Canada* [2000] 3 F.C. 327 ..... 294
*Bulbarela v. Canada* [2002] F.C.J. No. 846 ..... 301

d) *Membership in Particular Social Group*

*Chan v. Canada* [1995] 3 S.C.R. 593 ..... 305
*Al-Busaidy v. Canada* [1992] F.C.J. No. 26 ..... 310
*Gonzalez v. Canada* [2002] F.C.J. No. 456 ..... 312
*Mason v. Canada* [1995] F.C.J. No. 815 ..... 317
*Montchak v. Canada* [1999] F.C.J. No. 1111 ..... 319

***Week Six*: The Refugee Definition Continued**

*1. Persecution on Grounds of Sex and Sexual Orientation: A Review of the Elements*


Women Refugee Claimants Fearing Gender-Related Persecution: Guidelines Issued to the Chairperson Pursuant to Section 65(3) of the *Immigration Act* ..... 321
*Islam (A.P.) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department; R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Another Ex Parte Shah (A.P.)* ..... 331
Refugee Appeal No. 71427/99, Refugee Status Appeals Authority, New Zealand ..... 336
*Griffith v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration* ..... 347
*Lopez v. Canada* [2005] F.C. 61 ..... 356
*N. (L.X.) (Re)* [1992] C.R.R.D. No. 47 ..... 359
*Zamanibakhsh v. Canada* ..... 371
*Appellant S395/2002 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs* [2003] HCA 71 .. 377


*2. Minor Refugee Claimants and Refugees sur place*


*Qio Jian Bin v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* ..... 397


*3. Cessation and Compelling Reasons*


*Yamba v. Canada* [2000] F.C.J. No 457 ..... 406
*Gicu v. Canada* [1999] F.C.J. No. 404 ..... 410
*Baqri v. Canada* ..... 414


*4. Protected Persons*


*Li v. Canada* 2005 FCA 1 ..... 422
*Covarrubias v. Canada* 2006 FCA 365 ..... 429
*Amare v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* 2008 FC 228 ..... 438

## VOLUME 2

***Week Seven*: Refugee Determination Process**


Immigration and Refugee Board Statistics, January to June 2005 ..... 1
The Refugee Protection Claim Process – Flow Chart ..... 3
Canadian Council for Refugees, "The Refugee Appeal: Is No One Listening?" 31 March 2005 5
*Yusuf v. Canada* [1992] 1 F.C. 629 ..... 15
*Armson v. Canada* [1989] F.C.J. No. 800 ..... 17
*Burgos-Rojas v. Canada* [1999] F.C.J. No. 88 ..... 25
*Velauthar v. Canada* [1992] F.C.J. No. 425 ..... 28
*Saad v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration* ..... 31
Audrey Macklin, "Truth and Consequences: Credibility Determination in the Refugee Context" *International Association of Refugee Law Judges,* Conference Proceedings, 1998 ... 34
Juliet Cohen, "Questions of Credibility: Omissions, Discrepancies and Errors of Recall in the Testimony of Asylum Seekers" *Int'l J. of Refugee Law* Vol. 13 No. 3 ..... 41
Amy Shuman and Carol Bohmer, "Representing Trauma: Political Asylum Narrative" *Journal of American Folklore* 117 (2004) ..... 58
*Raza v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)* 2007 FCA 385 ..... 79


***Week Eight*: Report Back From Hearings – No Assigned Readings**

***Week Nine*: Denial of Protection: Exclusion and Security Certificates**

*1. Exclusion*


*Ramirez v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration)* [1992] 2 F.C. 306 (C.A.) ..... 84
*Zrig v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration* [2003] 3 F.C. 761 ..... 94
*Gil v. Canada* [1995] 1 F.C. 508 ..... 125
*Pushpanathan v. Canada* [1998] 1 S.C.R. 982 ..... 139


*2. Security Certificates*


*Suresh v. Canada* [2002] 1 S.C.R. 3 ..... 150
*Ahani v. Canada* [2002] SCC 2 ..... 182
*Ahani v. Canada* (CA) ..... 188
*Charkaoui v. Canada* 2007 SCC 7 ..... 224

***Week Ten*: Interdiction and Deterrence**


Francois Crepeau, "International Cooperation on Interdiction of Asylum-Seekers: A Global Perspective" Canadian Council for Refugees, *Migrant Interdiction* 1998 ..... 237
Lory Diana Rosenberg, "The Courts and Interception: The United States' Interdiction Experience and its Impact on Refugees and Asylum Seekers" (2003) *17 Geo. Immigr. L.J. 199* ..... 251
*Regina v. Immigration Officer at Prague Airport and another ex parte European Roma Rights Centre and Others* [2004] UKHL 55 ..... 266
Richard Wazana, "Fear and Loathing Down Under: Australian Refugee Policy and the National Imagination" *Refuge* Vol. 22, No. 1 ..... 292
*Regina v. Uxbridge Magistrates' Court and another, etc.,* [2001] 667 QB ..... 305
Tanya Weinberg, "Asylum Seekers Face U.S. Charges" *Sun Sentinel* ..... 321
*R (On the application of Q and others) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department* [2003] E.W.C.A. Civ. 364 ..... 324
"Canada and U.S. Negotiators Agree to Final Draft Text of Safe Third Country Agreement" . 347
Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "First Statistics Under Canada-U.S. Safe Third Country Agreement Show Decline in Refugee Claimants" ..... 352
Gregor Noll, "Visions of the Exceptional: Legal and Theoretical Issues Raised by Transit Processing Centres and Protection Zones" ..... 354


***Week Eleven*: Internally Displaced Persons**


Roberta Cohen, "The Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement: An Innovation in International Standard Setting" *Global Governance* 10 (2004) 459-480 ..... 357
United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, "Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement" ..... 379
Michael Barutciski, "Tensions between the refugee concept and the IDP debate" *Forced Migration Review* December 1998, 3, pp. 11-14 ..... 390
Bonaventure Rutinwa, "How tense is the tension between the refugee concept and the IDP debate?" *Forced Migration Review* April 1999, 4, pp. 29-32 ..... 394
Michael Kingsley-Nyinah, "What may be borrowed, what is new?" *Forced Migration Review* April 1999, 4, pp. 32-33 ..... 397
Jon Bennett, "Rights and Borders" *Forced Migration Review* April 1999, 4, pp. 33-34 ..... 398
Marc Vincent, "Protection and Assistance to IDPs" *Forced Migration Review* April 1999, 4, 34 399
Michael Barutciski, "Questioning the tensions between the 'refugee' and 'IDP' concepts: a rebuttal" *Forced Migration Review* April 1999, 4, p.35 ..... 400


***Week Twelve*: The Way Forward?**


James C. Hathaway and R. Alexander Neve, "Making International Refugee Law Relevant Again: A Collectivized and Solution-Oriented Protection" 10 *Harv. Hum. Rts. J.* 115 ..... 401
Deborah Anker, Joan Fitzpatrick and Andrew Shacknove, "RESPONSE: Crisis and Cure: A Reply to Hathaway/Neve and Schuck" *Harv. Hum. Rts. J.* (Spring 1998) 295 ..... 442
Peter H. Schuck, "A Response to the Critics" *Harv. Hum. Rts. J.* (Spring 1999) 385 ..... 454
Gaim Kibreab, "Citizenship rights and repatriation of refugees" *International Migration Review*: Tuesday, April 1, 2003, Vol. 37, Issue 1 ..... 459